

APPENDIX I

REVIEW SHEETS

COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS AND COMMENTS

ON

SOME OF THE MAJOR CHANGES  
THAT HAVE TAKEN PLACE IN

GINAN-E-SHARIF BHAG PAHELO

AND

GINAN-E-SHARIF BHAG BIJO

PUBLISHED BY OUR SISTER ASSOCIATIONS

PART 1 GINAN NO. 3

1

TITLE AB TERI MAHOBAT LAGI

REFERENCES OF OLD DOCUMENTS:

A. LALJI DEVRAJ (1905) EDITION 2/138

B. ISMAILIA ASSCN. INDIA (1952/54) EDITION SH/23

C.

VERSE #	ORIGINAL EXPRESSION as printed in the above referred authentic documents	MODIFIED VERSION as printed in Post Work-Shop Editions	OBSERVATION	SPECIAL REMARKS
9	ISHK AKAL BHULAVO	ISK AKAL BHULAYA	<p>A small 'correction' in the language of the GINAN has turned out the word BHULAVO into BHULAYA and has created confusion in understanding the meaning of the original expression.</p> <p>The careful analysis of this modification will reveal the fact that the original word 'requests' for something whereas the modified one declares about 'something which has happened in the past.'</p> <p>By pondering over the original composition, we can observe that every stanza is artfully balanced in its alliteration, whereas our modification makes the trend of the GINAN unarticulated.</p> <p>Let us have a look at that balance :</p>	'BHULAVO' is not a Hindu term - it does not reflect any Hinduistic elements.

PART 1 GINAN NO. 3

TITLE AB TERI (cont'd ...2)

REFERENCES OF OLD DOCUMENTS:

A. LALJI DEVRAJ (1905) EDITION 2 / 138

B. ISMAILIA ASSCN. INDIA (1952/54) EDITION SH/23

C.

VERSE #	ORIGINAL EXPRESSION as printed in the above referred authentic documents	MODIFIED VERSION as printed in Post Work-Shop Editions	OBSERVATION	SPECIAL REMARKS
			<p>DIKHLAVO</p> <p>MILAVO</p> <p>DILAVO</p> <p>CHALAVO</p> <p>LAVO</p> <p>BHULAYA (!)</p> <p>Was it necessary here to change the meaning and spoil the beauty of the original expres- sion ?</p>	

PART 1 GINAN NO. 7TITLE VENTI KARUN CHHUN SAHEB MORA

## REFERENCES OF OLD DOCUMENTS:

A. LALJI DEVRAJ (1905) EDITION 4 / 64B. ISMAILIA ASSCN. INDIA (1952/54) EDITION I / 231

C.

VERSE #	ORIGINAL EXPRESSION as printed in the above referred authentic documents	MODIFIED VERSION as printed in Post Work-Shop Editions	OBSERVATION	SPECIAL REMARKS
3	AME AVYA CHHUN	AME AVYA CHHIE	<p>The word CHHUN (as against currently spoken CHHIE) is an earlier form of Gujrati expression.</p> <p>While going through such expressions in our Ginanic language, sometimes, some people feel tempted to temper them with modern expressions, without inquiring into the origin or the history of the language. If we broaden our intellectual horizon in understanding such phraseology, we would realize that the Gujrati language has acquired a vast sweep of change in its 700 years history of development; and, therefore, it will be worthless to compare, and correct, our Ginanic language on the basis of our currently spoken language.</p>	The word 'chhun' is not at all a Hindu term.



PART 1 GINAN NO. 7TITLE VENTI KARUN CHHUN (cont'd ...2)

## REFERENCES OF OLD DOCUMENTS:

A. LALJI DEVRAJ (1905) EDITION 4 / 64B. ISMAILIA ASSCN. INDIA (1952/54) EDITION 9 / 231

C.

VERSE #	ORIGINAL EXPRESSION as printed in the above referred authentic documents	MODIFIED VERSION as printed in Post Work-Shop Editions	OBSERVATION	SPECIAL REMARKS
			Our Ginanic literature, in all respects, is our Wonderful Tradition, and this tradition must be kept in its original term, as the Shakesperian tradition is kept unchanged in English literature, or Rumi's tradition in Persian literature.	

PART 1 GINAN NO. 12TITLE UTH BETH BANDA

## REFERENCES OF OLD DOCUMENTS:

A. LALJI DEVRAJ (1905) EDITION 2/24B. ISMAILIA ASSCN. INDIA (1952/54) EDITION S/104

C. RECREATION CLUB, 5TH EDITION (1936) 2/29

VERSE #	ORIGINAL EXPRESSION as printed in the above referred authentic documents	MODIFIED VERSION as printed in Post Work-Shop Editions	OBSERVATION	SPECIAL REMARKS
6	JO SUKH LODIO BANDA TO TAME JAGO	JO TAME JAGO BANDA TO SUKH PAMO	Please compare carefully the modified version with the original expression and see how the original expression has been swept away with unwarranted, unworthy and unapplicable corrections. Also please observe the variation in the poetic style and mode of expression. It seems clear that someone has tried to 'recompose' these verses at the cost of their traditional beauty of poetic articulation and their peculiar mode of symbolic expression.  A thorough comparison of this variation will reveal the fact that the original expression is free from all objectionable and Hindu Elements, whereas the modified version is far from any substantial contribution.  Why than was it felt necessary to make these corrections ?	The original verses do not have any trace of HINDU ELEMENTS.
8	AAPNI AAP URANG RACHNA ETI TO SUDH GAMAI	URANG URANG JIYAN LAGI RACHNA - ESI TE SUDH GAMAI		
8	TRAN PAHOR UPAR EK NA RAHENA	TRAN PAHOR SUTO EK POR NA JAGYO		

PART 1 GINAN NO. 12TITLE UTH BETH BANDA (cont'd ...2)

## REFERENCES OF OLD DOCUMENTS:

- A. LALJI DEVRAJ (1905) EDITION 2/24  
 B. ISMAILIA ASSCN. INDIA (1952/54) EDITION S/104  
 C. RECREATION CLUB 5TH EDITION (1936) 2/29

VERSE #	ORIGINAL EXPRESSION as printed in the above referred authentic documents	MODIFIED VERSION as printed in Post Work-Shop Editions	OBSERVATION	SPECIAL REMARKS
10	DADHO	GADO	This alteration is not capable of producing any specific mean- ing.	Does the word DADHO denote any Hinduism?
12	SAHESHTRA PACHAS <u>VARASNO</u> EK DIN	SAHESTRA PACHAS NO EK DIN	Just one word is omitted here, making the sentence ambiguous !	VARASNO is not a Hindu term.
16	JIS PER TERO	JO HOVENGO	This alteration simply ruins the spirit of original expres- sion.	JIS PER TERO is not a Hindu ter



PART 1 GINAN NO. 13

TITLE KAINRE MOMANBHAI TAME

REFERENCES OF OLD DOCUMENTS:

- A. LALJI DEVRAJ (1905) EDITION 2/131
- B. ISMAILIA ASSCN. INDIA (1952/54) EDITION S /199
- C. RECREATION CLUB 5TH EDITION 2/157

VERSE #	ORIGINAL EXPRESSION as printed in the above referred authentic documents	MODIFIED VERSION as printed in Post Work-Shop Editions	OBSERVATION	SPECIAL REMARKS
5	NAKLANKI	NAR ALI	<p>As our Ginanic language is enriched with its symbolic expressions, so it is elevated with divinely inspired spiritual force transformed into verbal manifestation, and when it is tempered with some artificial substitution, we certainly feel that something tangible is missing in it. It strikes to us as flat and pedestrian.</p> <p>Why does the word "NAR ALI" strike so flat and pedestrian to us ? BECAUSE it is a superficial substitution of the word Naklanki.</p> <p>Etymologically speaking the word "NAKLANK" means : Spotless, Sinless, Holy, Pure, Stainless and Immaculate. When this word is used alone or as a modifier, it becomes an ordinary noun or a simple adjective, but when it modifies the word AVTAR</p>	<p>The word 'NAKLANKI' has nothing to do with a Hindu idiology.</p>



PART 1 GINAN NO. 13TITLE KAINRE MOMANBHAI TAME (cont'd ...2)

## REFERENCES OF OLD DOCUMENTS:

- A. LALJI DEVRAJ (1905) EDITION 2 / 131  
 B. ISMAILIA ASSCN. INDIA (1952/54) EDITION S / 199  
 C. RECREATION CLUB 5TH EDITION 2/157

VERSE #	ORIGINAL EXPRESSION as printed in the above referred authentic documents	MODIFIED VERSION as printed in Post Work-Shop Editions	OBSERVATION	SPECIAL REMARKS
			<p>it conveys the meaning of the "HOLY DECENDENT" (of Ali and Nabi)".</p> <p>However, in this stanza, the word NAKLANKI stands alone and it does not modify any other word.</p> <p>Sometimes this word is mistakenly related with the theory of DAS AVTAR, but in reality it is only used by our Pirs to describe the purity of Imamat. Whoever is holy, pure, spotless or sinless could be known as NAKLANKI, but in the eyes of our Pirs, there is nobody Naklanki in this world except our IMAMS and, therefore, they have used this word to glorify the purity of our Imams.</p> <p>Why then should we victimize this innocent word ?</p>	

PART 1 GINAN NO. 20

## REFERENCES OF OLD DOCUMENTS:

A. LALJI DEVRAJ (1905) EDITION 4 / 37B. ISMAILIA ASSCN. INDIA (1952/54) EDITION S / 27

C.

TITLE GAT LOKAJIE U MAYO

VERSE #	ORIGINAL EXPRESSION as printed in the above referred authentic documents	MODIFIED VERSION as printed in Post Work-Shop Editions	OBSERVATION	SPECIAL REMARKS
1	SHAM	SHAH	The word "SHAM" or "SAM" is a sweet abbreviation of the word "SHAMI" or "SAMI" which is generally used in a poetic form. When we had no objection in accepting the root word of "SHAM" in our Ginan # 5, why have we rejected its abbreviation ?	Is SHAM a Hindu word ?
5	LODEO	LONIYO	Is there any reason for changing this word ?	"LODEO" is not a Hindu word
7	DEV	SHAH	Could anyone dare to describe the word ALLAH as non-Islamic because the pagan Arabs used to call God by this name before the advent of Hazart Muhammed (S.A.S.) ?  Could anyone describe the word DEV as non-Islamic because God is called in Sanskrit language by this name ?	

PART 1 GINAN NO. 20TITLE GAT LOKAJIE UMayO (cont'd ...2)

## REFERENCES OF OLD DOCUMENTS:

A. LALJI DEVRAJ (1905) EDITION 4/37B. ISMAILIA ASSCN. INDIA (1952/54) EDITION S/27

C.

VERSE #	ORIGINAL EXPRESSION as printed in the above referred authentic documents	MODIFIED VERSION as printed in Post Work-Shop Editions	OBSERVATION	SPECIAL REMARKS
			<p>If some one does so, let us remind him with this QURANIC AYAT :</p> <p>"By whatever (names) you call on Him, He has the best names" (Q.17:110)</p>	



PART 1 GINAN NO. 29TITLE SAKHI MAHAPAD KERE WAT

## REFERENCES OF OLD DOCUMENTS:

A. LALJI DEVRAJ (1905) EDITION 3/40B. ISMAILIA ASSCN. INDIA (1952/54) EDITION S / 140

C.

VERSE #	ORIGINAL EXPRESSION as printed in the above referred authentic documents	MODIFIED VERSION as printed in Post Work-Shop Editions	OBSERVATION	SPECIAL REMARKS
1 to 9	-	KE	There is an unnecessary addition of the word "KE" at ten different places.	
13	SHAM	SAR	The word "SHAM" conveys twofold meaning in our Ginanic literature : Firstly, it represents a short poetic form to convey the mean- ing of "SAMI". Exactly the same word which has received our acceptance in our modified version; and it has appeared throughout our modern edition. Secondly, the word "SHAM" conveys the Sufi doctrinal meaning of the 'Creative Darkness', which is also known to be the "External Matrix of Darkness" in which the source of LIGHT appears and disappears. This darkness is also known as the 'ultimate reality', and, therefore, the	

PART 1 GINAN NO. 29TITLE SAKHI MAHAPAD KERE WAT (cont'd ...2)

## REFERENCES OF OLD DOCUMENTS:

- A. LALJI DEVRAJ (1905) EDITION 3/40  
 B. ISMAILIA ASSCN. INDIA (1952/54) EDITION S /  
 C.

VERSE #	ORIGINAL EXPRESSION as printed in the above referred authentic documents	MODIFIED VERSION as printed in Post Work-Shop Editions	OBSERVATION	SPECIAL REMARKS
			<p>meaning of the word "SHAM" conveys the meaning of the ultimate reality, which can be perceived only through Batuni Bandgi.</p> <p>In the original version Pir Sadardin explains about something which he had seen in his Batuni Bandgi. The object of his observation was the "SHAM", which we have switched over to "SAR". Does the word "SHAM" contain any harmful element? Does the word "SAR" contain any meaningful equation?</p> <p>We have replaced that "SHAM" with the meaningless word "SAR" - and with that little change we have destroyed the whole concept of spiritual realization which Pir Sadardin wanted to convey in the summing up of this Ginan.</p>	

PART 1 GINAN NO. 31TITLE HO JIRE MARA HANSA

## REFERENCES OF OLD DOCUMENTS:

A. LALJI DEVRAJ (1905) EDITION 5 / 27B. ISMAILIA ASSCN. INDIA (1952/54) EDITION S / 197

C.

VERSE #	ORIGINAL EXPRESSION as printed in the above referred authentic documents	MODIFIED VERSION as printed in Post Work-Shop Editions	OBSERVATION	SPECIAL REMARKS
2	-	AA  (meaning 'this')	One addition of an inconsistent word makes a fundamental change in the meaning of the stanza.	



PART 1 GINAN NO. 36TITLE SAMUDAR BAHOTAN BANU

## REFERENCES OF OLD DOCUMENTS:

A. LALJI DEVRAJ (1905) EDITION 1/ 50B. ISMAILIA ASSCN. INDIA (1952/54) EDITION S

C.

VERSE #	ORIGINAL EXPRESSION as printed in the above referred authentic documents	MODIFIED VERSION as printed in Post Work-Shop Editions	OBSERVATION	SPECIAL REMARKS
11	KHUDAWAND	SAHEB	!	'KHUDAWAND not a Hind

PART 1 GINAN NO. 39

15

TITLE JIRE BHAIRE JUTHI RE DUNIYA

REFERENCES OF OLD DOCUMENTS:

A. LALJI DEVRAJ (1905) EDITION 1/138

B. ISMAILIA ASSCN. INDIA (1952/54) EDITION S/93

C.

VERSE #	ORIGINAL EXPRESSION as printed in the above referred authentic documents	MODIFIED VERSION as printed in Post Work-Shop Editions	OBSERVATION	SPECIAL REMARKS
1	ALAKHNI	ALKHKI	This modification provides an evident example of modernizing our Ginanic language at the cost of its original, unsurmountable beauty of expression	None of these three words contain any Hindu Element
3	EKLA	EKALDA		
3	CHALNA	CHULNA		
4	NISASA	DHUSASA	It is difficult to understand why we have converted NISASA into DHUSASA !	'NISASA' is not a Hindu word

PART 1 GINAN NO. 39

15

TITLE JIRE BHAIRE JUTHI RE DUNIYA

REFERENCES OF OLD DOCUMENTS:

A. LALJI DEVRAJ (1905) EDITION 1/138

B. ISMAILIA ASSCN. INDIA (1952/54) EDITION S/93

C.

VERSE #	ORIGINAL EXPRESSION as printed in the above referred authentic documents	MODIFIED VERSION as printed in Post Work-Shop Editions	OBSERVATION	SPECIAL REMARKS
1	ALAKHNI	ALKHKI	This modification provides an evident example of modernizing our Ginanic language at the cost of its original, unsurmountable beauty of expression	None of these three words contain any Hindu Element
3	EKLA	EKALDA		
3	CHALNA	CHULNA		
4	NISASA	DHUSASA	It is difficult to understand why we have converted NISASA into DHUSASA !	'NISASA' is not a Hindu word



PART 1 GINAN NO. 41TITLE SETH KAHE TAME SAMBHLO VANOTAR

## REFERENCES OF OLD DOCUMENTS:

A. LALJI DEVRAJ (1905) EDITION 3 / 73B. ISMAILIA ASSCN. INDIA (1952/54) EDITION S / 154C. THE KHOJA SINDHI PRESS (1921) EDITION 50 GINANSPart 3/pp 75

VERSE #	ORIGINAL EXPRESSION as printed in the above referred authentic documents	MODIFIED VERSION as printed in Post Work-Shop Editions	OBSERVATION	SPECIAL REMARKS
10	-	OCHHUN DIKHUN JIWDE ADKERUN LIDHUN-JIWNI CHINTA KIDHIJI (1)	This stanza seems to be mixed up with some other Ginan, as it does not appear in the above- mentioned authentic documents.	
12	OSIKA	OCHHAD	OSIKA means a pillow OCHHAD means a bed-sheet  Why have we chosen OCHHAD in the place of OSIKA ?	'OSIKA' is not a Hindu term
12	WAY	WAHO	What difference does WAHO make over WAY ?	'WAY' is not a Hindu word